ORIGINAL

EXCEPTION



| 1 | Thomas A. Loquvam | AZ CORP COMMISSION |
|------|--|--|
| 2 | Thomas L. Mumaw | AZ CORP COMMISSION DOCKET CONTROL |
| 3 | Melissa M. Krueger Amanda Ho | 2017 AUG -4 P 2: 58 |
| 2.00 | Pinnacle West Capital Corporation | 2.30 |
| 4 | 400 North 5 th Street, MS 8695 | Arizona Corporation Commiss |
| 5 | Phoenix, Arizona 85004 Tel: (602) 250-3630 | DOCKETED |
| 6 | Fax: (602) 250-3393 | AUG 4 2017 |
| 7 | E-Mail: Thomas.Loquvam@pinnaclewest.co | |
| | Thomas.Mumaw@pinnaclewest.com | |
| 8 | Melissa.Krueger@pinnaclewest.com Amanda.Ho@pinnaclewest.com | <u>.</u> |
| 9 | • | |
| 10 | Attorneys for Arizona Public Service Compa | ny |
| 11 | BEFORE THE ARIZONA CO | DDOD ATION COMMISSION |
| 12 | DEFORE THE ARIZONA CO | M ORATION COMMISSION |
| 13 | COMMISSIONERS | |
| 14 | TOM FORESE, Chairman | |
| | BOB BURNS DOUG LITTLE | |
| 15 | ANDY TOBIN BOYD DUNN | |
| 16 | BOTO DUNN | |
| 17 | IN THE MATTER OF THE | DOCKET NO. E-01345A-16-0036 |
| 18 | APPLICATION OF ARIZONA PUBLIC SERVICE COMPANY FOR A HEARING | |
| 19 | TO DETERMINE THE FAIR VALUE OF | ARIZONA PUBLIC SERVICE |
| 20 | THE UTILITY PROPERTY OF THE COMPANY FOR RATEMAKING | COMPANY'S EXCEPTIONS AND CLARIFICATIONS TO |
| | PURPOSES, TO FIX A JUST AND REASONABLE RATE OF RETURN | RECOMMENDED OPINION AND ORDER |
| 21 | THEREON, TO APPROVE RATE SCHEDULES DESIGNED TO DEVELOP | |
| 22 | SUCH RETURN. | |
| 23 | IN THE MATTER OF FUEL AND | DOCKET NO. E-01345A-16-0123 |
| 24 | PURCHASED POWER PROCUREMENT AUDITS FOR ARIZONA PUBLIC | Section and Australia Australia and Australia and Australia Austra |
| 25 | SERVICE COMPANY. | |
| 26 | APS appreciates the hard work that | udge Jibilian, ACC Staff, RUCO, and all |
| 27 | other parties have put into this proceeding. | 27 |
| 28 | Opinion and Order exemplifies this effort, an | , |
| | opinion and order exemplifies uns errort, ar | a also provides hisight lifto what it took to |

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

get here. As stated in the ROO, "a broad range of parties representing vastly different interests were able to craft a comprehensive agreement through negotiation and compromise." This is undeniably the case.

Twenty-nine parties representing virtually every perspective in this proceeding were able to find enough common ground to resolve their differences. Through the course of vigorous negotiation and after numerous compromises, the parties successfully crafted a Settlement Agreement that not only offers numerous benefits to customers, but also accomplishes many outcomes that would simply not have been possible with a litigated outcome, including a pilot program to incent customers to adopt technologies to manage demand and reduce system peak; the continuation of a cost-based buy-through program for industrial and large commercial customers; a program designed to make rooftop solar more accessible to limited income customers; and, a historic resolution to long-standing disputes between APS and the rooftop solar industry.

APS strongly supports the ROO's adoption of the Settlement Agreement. There are two items, however, that the parties included in their Term Sheet and Settlement Agreement, but which the ROO did not include. APS requests that these two items be expressly articulated in the ROO to reflect the settling parties' intent. These items, as well as other, limited exceptions and clarifications, are addressed below.

I. THE ROO REQUIRES THREE ADJUSTMENTS TO ACCURATELY REFLECT THE SETTLING PARTIES' AGREEMENT.

To reach a settlement, the parties made a series of interrelated compromises. The final terms they reached were initially reflected in the March 1, 2017 Term Sheet, and later reproduced in the final Settlement Agreement itself. The signing parties offer these terms as an interdependent whole. When taken together, the terms constitute a conclusion to this rate case that each of the signing parties can support.

By adopting the Settlement Agreement, the ROO adopted this interdependent package. In doing so, the ROO should have explicitly included two terms that the

¹ ROO at 59.

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

28

settling parties expressly included as part of their global compromise: (1) specific language, similar to that adopted by the ROO for the Ocotillo Modernization Project, providing for a deferral of the costs to install Selective Catalytic Reduction (SCR) equipment at the Four Corners Power Plant; and (2) funding the \$1.25 million in additional crisis bill assistance through the revenue requirement. In addition, the ROO referenced the agreed-upon June 1, 2019 date for the Rate Case Stability provision, but ordered a June 19, 2019 date.

The ROO appears to adopt the SCR deferral and step increase, but appears to inadvertently omit critical language needed to support the A. deferral.

In Section 9.1 of the Settlement Agreement, the parties agreed that APS should be permitted to seek an adjustment to its rates to reflect the costs associated with installing the SCR equipment at the Four Corners Power Plant. The ROO recommends that the Commission approve this component of the parties' agreement.

The ROO does not address, however, the other component of the parties' agreement related to the Four Corners SCRs: the deferral of the associated costs before any step increase. In Paragraph 7(b) of the Term Sheet, the parties agreed that "APS would be permitted a cost deferral order in this proceeding for the [Four Corners] SCRs..." The parties reiterated this term in Section 9.2 of the Settlement Agreement, which provides that until APS can adjust its rates to reflect the SCR costs, APS should be permitted to defer those costs.² Although the ROO clearly indicates its intent to adopt the Settlement Agreement,3 it does not expressly include language needed to accomplish this deferral.

APS's outside auditors require precise language to permit a cost deferral language that the ROO already recommends in relation to the Ocotillo Modernization Project.4 Without this language, APS likely cannot defer the costs. And without the ability to defer costs associated with installing the Four Corners SCRs, APS may need to

See ROO at 102.

²⁷ See Settlement Agreement at 9.2.

See ROO at 59.

immediately file a new rate case. In Attachment 1, APS provides language that would amend the ROO to reflect the signing parties' agreement.

B. The settling parties intended for the crisis bill assistance to be included in the revenue requirement.

Section 29 of the Settlement Agreement provides that APS will fund the crisis bill assistance program by \$1.25 million annually. Based on comments by Commission Staff in its closing briefs, the ROO indicates that APS shareholders will provide this funding. This funding specifically, however, does not appear in the Settlement Agreement. Instead, the March 1 Term Sheet demonstrates the parties' agreement that this crisis bill assistance funding would be part of the overall revenue requirement.

The Term Sheet reflects the parties' agreement, stating that the \$87.25 million non-fuel, non-depreciation revenue requirement increase specifically included "\$1.25 million dedicated to crisis bill assistance." The final Settlement Agreement filed later that month was not intended to and did not change the terms on which the parties had already agreed. Instead, the Settlement Agreement was only intended to distill the term sheet into final language. Indeed, that the final Settlement Agreement does not actually reference the ultimate source of the funding, and instead merely states that APS will fund the \$1.25 million in crisis bill assistance, is consistent with funding from the overall revenue requirement.

Funding the crisis bill assistance from the revenue requirement is an important component of the Settlement Agreement. The ROO clearly recommends adopting the Settlement Agreement.⁶ The sole provision on which the ROO indicates any intent to deviate from the Settlement Agreement is with regard to customer notifications related to the 90-day trial period, and in deviating, the ROO does so clearly.⁷ By contrast, the ROO does not indicate any intent to deviate from the Settlement Agreement in relation to the crisis bill assistance funding. Accordingly, APS requests that the ROO be

⁵ See Term Sheet at Paragraph 1, filed in Docket No. E-01345A-16-0036 and E-01345A-16-0123 on March 1, 2017.

⁶ See ROO at 59.

⁷ See ROO at 53-54 and 102.

modified to reflect the parties' intent by replacing references to funding "by shareholders" with funding in the revenue requirement. The amendment in Attachment 1 provides changes to the ROO so that it conforms to the parties' intended agreement.

C. APS requests a minor clarification regarding the rate case stability provision.

Section 4.2 of the Settlement Agreement provides that APS will not file its next general rate case before June 1, 2019. In adopting the Settlement Agreement, the ROO highlights several benefits to customers, including that the Agreement "precludes APS from seeking a base rate increase prior to June 1, 2019...." But in its ordering paragraph, the ROO states that the parties agreed to APS not filing before June 19, 2019. APS requests clarification that the ROO intended to reflect the parties' agreement related to the Rate Case Stability Provision, and in particular, that the timeframe for APS's next rate case be modified to reflect no filing before June 1, 2019, rather than June 19, 2019.

II. THE SEPTEMBER 1 RATE EFFECTIVE DATE EXCEEDS THE TIME CLOCK AND IS UNNECESSARY.

The ROO recommends that the new rates established in this proceeding be effective on September 1. This date, however, would be 15 months after APS filed its application, and 13 days after the time clock expires on August 19. And if the Commission considers the ROO during its regularly-scheduled Open Meeting on August 15-16, there does not appear to be a reason to delay the rate effective date until September 1.

In fact, substantial reason exists for rates to be effective before September 1.

Adopting the Settlement Agreement entails finding that the Settlement Agreement would produce just and reasonable rates, and is in the public interest. With that finding,

⁹ See ROO at 22 and 101.

⁸ ROO at 59.

¹⁰ APS calculates the time clock as follows: 360 days established in A.A.C. R14-2-103(B)(11)(d)(i); plus 33 days as ordered in the January 13, 2017 Procedural Order; and an additional 21 days due to the 7 days of hearing as provided for in A.A.C. R14-2-103(B)(11)(f). This adds up to a total of 414 days after APS's filing was accepted and deemed sufficient on July 1, 2016, which is August 19, 2017.

there is no reason to delay implementation. Moreover, a significant amount of revenue collection occurs during the summer months. Each day on which APS is not able to implement already-approved rates causes APS to lose revenue that it can never otherwise recoup. Assuming the rates recommended by the ROO are found to be in the public interest and approved, this loss can be and should be avoided.

As a final note, the transition to charging the rates set forth in the Settlement Agreement requires certain adjustments to APS's billing system. Given the need for these adjustments, a rate effective date that falls over a weekend would facilitate a smoother transition for customers. Accordingly, APS respectfully requests that the rate effective date for new rates ordered in this proceeding be changed to the first Saturday after the Commission votes on this matter. If the Commission votes on this matter during the August Open Meeting, this would mean that rates would be effective on August 19th.

III. THE RECORD CONTAINS SUFFICIENT EVIDENCE TO SUPPORT THE SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT'S PROVISION REGARDING AMI.

The ROO bifurcates a decision regarding issues related to AMI opt-out to a separate decision. APS does not necessarily oppose resolving AMI opt-out issues in a separate decision. Because a significant amount of evidence has been introduced into the record regarding all issues related to AMI, there is more than enough evidence to support the AMI opt-out program outlined in the Settlement Agreement. Accordingly, APS requests that the Commission make a decision based upon the evidence introduced in this proceeding, and not order another proceeding or the introduction of additional evidence.

IV. APS DOES NOT OPPOSE THE 90-DAY NOTIFICATION REQUIREMENT.

As the ROO notes, APS is committed to ensuring that customers receive the information they need related to their options at the end of the 90-day trial period. Although the Settlement Agreement did not otherwise prescribe the information that

¹¹ See Settlement Agreement at Section 19.1.

27

28

APS is to provide to customers during this 90-day period, the ROO does provide for some general parameters for how APS is to inform customers.¹² APS considers this additional requirement to be consistent with the intent of the Settlement Agreement, and does not oppose this addition.

V. APS SUPPORTS THE ROO'S CONCLUSION REGARDING THE E-32L RATCHET.

APS strongly supports the ROO's recommendation related to the ratchet in the E-32L rate. The parties introduced a substantial amount of evidence into the record regarding E-32L rate design, the nature and purpose of batteries, and the most appropriate way to incentivize new technologies. The ROO concludes that transparent incentives, rather than incentives embedded in rate design, are the best means to promote the adoption of new technologies. APS agrees. Transparent incentives offer numerous advantages over incentives buried in rate design, including that they:

- permit the Commission to increase the amount of incentives to achieve targeted policy objectives;
- permit the Commission to decrease the amount of incentives if technology costs decline or it becomes apparent that the industry has matured enough so that it no longer needs customer-funded subsidies;
- permit the Commission to structure incentives in a way that avoids oversubsidizing projects, such as the reverse-auction structure used to award up-front incentives to rooftop solar installations in years past;
- avoid questions of whether and how to grandfather customers who might otherwise rely on incentives embedded in rate design when making decisions on whether to adopt technologies; and
- provides transparency into the amount of incentives being paid in a manner that facilitates robust dialogue regarding the nature and purpose of incentives used to encourage developing technologies.

¹² See ROO at 102.

| 1 | APS is committed to developing a transparent and effective incentive program that | |
|----|--|--|
| 2 | encourages the thoughtful adoption of battery technology. | |
| 3 | VI. CONCLUSION | |
| 4 | APS requests that the Commission approve the ROO with the following | |
| 5 | modifications: | |
| 6 | Add language reflecting the parties' agreement that permits APS to defer | |
| 7 | the costs associated with installing the Four Corners SCRs as indicated in | |
| 8 | Attachment 1; | |
| 9 | • Reflect the parties' intent that the \$1.25 million in crisis bill assistance be | |
| 10 | funded in the revenue requirement as indicated in Attachment 1; | |
| 11 | • Change the rate effective date to the first Saturday after a Commission | |
| 12 | vote on this matter; and | |
| 13 | Clarify that APS's next rate case cannot be filed before June 1, 2019, | |
| 14 | rather than June 19, 2019. | |
| 15 | | |
| 16 | 11. | |
| 17 | RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED thisday of August 2017. | |
| 18 | | |
| 19 | By: | |
| 20 | Thomas L. Mumaw | |
| 21 | Melissa M. Krueger Amanda Ho | |
| 22 | Attorneys for Arizona Public Service Company | |
| 23 | ORIGINAL and thirteen (13) copies | |
| 24 | of the foregoing filed this day of August 2017, with: | |
| 25 | Docket Control | |
| 26 | ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION | |
| 27 | 1200 West Washington Street Phoenix Arizona 85007 | |

| 1 2 | COPY of the foregoing emailed / mailed this 4th day of August 2017 to: | |
|-----|--|---|
| 3 | | |
| 4 | Albert Acken Ryley Carlock & Applewhite | Ann-Marie Anderson Wright Welker & Paoule, PLC |
| 5 | One N. Central Ave., Ste 1200 Phoenix, AZ 85004-4417 | 10429 South 51st Street., Suite 285 Phoenix, AZ 85009 |
| 6 | | |
| 7 | Brendon Baatz Manager | Stephen Baron Consultant |
| 8 | ACEEE 529 14th Street N.W., Suite 600 | J. Kennedy & Associates 570 Colonial Park Drive, Suite 305 |
| 9 | Washington, DC 20045-1000 | Roswell, GA 30075 |
| 10 | Patrick Black | Kurt Boehm |
| 11 | Attorney Fennemore Craig | Attorney BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY |
| 12 | 2394 East Camelback Road, Suite 600 Phoenix, AZ 85016 | 36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510 Cincinnati, OH 45202 |
| 13 | | |
| 14 | Bradley Carroll Assistant General Counsel, State | Steve Chriss Senior Manager, Energy Regulatory |
| 15 | Regulatory Tucson Electric Power Company | Analysis Walmart Stores |
| 16 | 88 East Broadway Blvd. Mail Stop HQE910 | 2001 Southeast 10th Street Bentonville, AR 72716-5530 |
| 17 | P.O. Box 711 Tucson, AZ 85702 | |
| 18 | | |
| 19 | John B. Coffman John B. Coffman, LLC | Jody Cohn Attorney |
| 20 | 871 Tuxedo Blvd. St. Louis, MO 63119 | Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry 36 E. Seventh St., Suite 1510 |
| 21 | St. Louis, WO 03119 | Cincinnati, OH 45202 |
| 22 | Jim Downing | Brittany L. DeLorenzo |
| 23 | PO Box 70 Salome, AZ 85648 | Corporate Counsel IO DATA CENTERS, LLC |
| 24 | report (Audoration Applied Table Table Applied Appli | 615 N. 48th St. Phoenix, AZ 85008 |
| 25 | | |
| 26 | | |
| 27 | | |

| 1 2 | Nicholas Enoch Attorney Lubin & Enoch, P.C. 349 North Fourth Ave. | Greg Eisert Director Government Affairs Chairman Sun City Homeowners Association 10401 W. Coggins Drive |
|----------|--|--|
| 3 | Phoenix, AZ 85003 | Sun City, AZ 85351 |
| 4 | Patricia Ferre | Giancarlo Estrada |
| 5 | P.O. Box 433 Payson, AZ 85547 | Kamper, Estrada and Simmons, LLP 3030 N. Third St., Suite 770 |
| 6 | | Phoenix, AZ 85012 |
| 7 | Richard Gayer | Denis M. Fitzgibbons |
| 8 | 526 W. Wilshire Dr. Phoenix, Arizona 85003 | FITZGIBBONS LAW OFFICES, PLC P.O. Box 11208 |
| 9 | | Casa Grande, AZ 85230 |
| 10 | Al Gervenack | Jason D. Gellman |
| 11 | Robert Miller Property Owners & Residents | Snell & Wilmer LLP 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 800 |
| 12 | Association 13815 Camino del Sol | Phoenix, AZ 85004 |
| 13 | Sun City West, AZ 85372 | |
| 14 | Elijah Abinah | Meghan Grabel |
| 15 | Director Utilities Division | Attorney for AIC Osborn Maledon, P.A. |
| 16 | Arizona Corporation Commission 1200 W. Washington | 2929 North Central Avenue Phoenix, AZ 85012 |
| 17 | Phoenix, AZ 85007 | |
| 18 | Tom Harris | Garry D. Hays |
| 19 | Chairman Arizona Solar Energy Industries | Attorney for ASDA Law Offices of Garry D. Hays, PC |
| 20 | Association 2122 W. Lone Cactus Dr. Suite 2 | 2198 E Camelback Rd, Suite 305 Phoenix, AZ 85016 |
| 21 | Phoenix, AZ 85027 | |
| 22 | Chris Hendrix | Kevin Hengehold |
| 23 | Director of Markets & Compliance Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. | Energy Program Director Arizona Community Action Association |
| 24 25 | 2011 S.E. 10th Street Bentonville, AR 72716 | 2700 n. 3rd St., Suite 3040 Phoenix, AZ 85004 |
| 26 | | |
| 27 | | |
| 28 | | |
| 20 | | |

| 2 215 South State Street, Suite 200 Salt Lake City, UT 84111 5 Salt Lake City, UT 84111 5 Steve Jennings AARP 16165 N. 83rd Ave, Suite 201 Peoria, AZ 85382 7 Teena Jibilian Assistant Chief Administrative Law Judge Arizona Corporation Commission 1200 W. Washington Phoenix, AZ 85007 8 Program Director Vote Solar 360 22nd Street, Suite 730 Oakland, CA 94612 16 Curt Ledford McDonald Carano Wilson, LLP 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 17 Samuel L. Lofland Ryley Carlock & Applewhite One N. Central Ave. Ste 1200 Phoenix, AZ 85028 18 Jay Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center for Law in the Public Interest 514 W. Roosevelt St. Phoenix, AZ 85003 Alar Kierman Director of Real Estate & Special Counsel IO Data Centers 615 N. 48th Street Phoenix, AZ 85008 Alan Kierman Director of Real Estate & Special Counsel IO Data Centers 615 N. 48th Street Phoenix, AZ 85008 Caraig Marks Attorney AURA 10645 N. Tatum Blvd. Ste. 200-676 Phoenix, AZ 85028 Jason Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Greg Patterson Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 1 | Kevin Higgins Energy Strategies, LLC | Timothy Hogan Attorney |
|--|----|--|--------------------------------------|
| 5 Steve Jennings AARP 16 16165 N. 83rd Ave, Suite 201 Peoria, AZ 85382 Teena Jibilian Assistant Chief Administrative Law Judge Arizona Corporation Commission 1200 W. Washington Phoenix, AZ 85007 Briana Kobor Program Director Vote Solar 360 22nd Street, Suite 730 Oakland, CA 94612 Curt Ledford McDonald Carano Wilson, LLP 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 Jay Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney Munger Chadwick 916 West Adams Suite 3 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | | 215 South State Street, Suite 200 Salt Lake City, UT, 84111 | Arizona Center for Law in the Public |
| Steve Jennings AARP 16165 N. 83rd Ave, Suite 201 Peoria, AZ 85382 Teena Jibilian Assistant Chief Administrative Law Judge Arizona Corporation Commission 1200 W. Washington Phoenix, AZ 85007 Briana Kobor Program Director Vote Solar 360 22nd Street, Suite 730 Oakland, CA 94612 Curt Ledford McDonald Carano Wilson, LLP 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 Jay Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center Munger Chadwick 916 West Adams Suite 3 Phoenix, AZ 85007 Thomas A. Jerigan 139 Barnes Drive, Suite 1 Tyndall AFB, FL 32403 Alan Kierman Director of Real Estate & Special Counsel IO Data Centers 615 N. 48th Street Phoenix, AZ 85008 Samuel L. Lofland Ryley Carlock & Applewhite One N. Central Ave., Ste 1200 Phoenix, AZ 85004-4417 Craig Marks Attorney AURA 10645 N. Tatum Blvd. Ste. 200-676 Phoenix, AZ 85028 Jason Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Greg Patterson Attorney Munger Chadwick 916 West Adams Suite 3 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 3 | San Lake City, O1 04111 | 514 W. Roosevelt St. |
| AARP 16165 N. 83rd Ave, Suite 201 Peoria, AZ 85382 Teena Jibilian Assistant Chief Administrative Law Judge Arizona Corporation Commission 1200 W. Washington Phoenix, AZ 85007 Briana Kobor Program Director Vote Solar 360 22nd Street, Suite 730 Oakland, CA 94612 Curt Ledford McDonald Carano Wilson, LLP 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 Jay Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85004 AARP 139 Barnes Drive, Suite 1 Tyndall AFB, FL 32403 Alan Kierman Director of Real Estate & Special Counsel IO Data Centers 615 N. 48th Street Phoenix, AZ 85008 Caruel L. Lofland Ryley Carlock & Applewhite One N. Central Ave., Ste 1200 Phoenix, AZ 85004-4417 Craig Marks Attorney AURA 10645 N. Tatum Blvd. Ste. 200-676 Phoenix, AZ 85028 Jason Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85004-2202 | 4 | | Filoellix, AZ 85005 |
| 16165 N. 83rd Ave, Suite 201 Peoria, AZ 85382 Teena Jibilian Assistant Chief Administrative Law Judge Arizona Corporation Commission 120 W. Washington Phoenix, AZ 85007 Briana Kobor Program Director Vote Solar 360 22nd Street, Suite 730 Oakland, CA 94612 Curt Ledford McDonald Carano Wilson, LLP 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 Jay Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Jason Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Tyndall AFB, FL 32403 Alan Kierman Director of Real Estate & Special Counsel 10 Data Centers 615 N. 48th Street Phoenix, AZ 85008 Samuel L. Lofland Ryley Carlock & Applewhite One N. Central Ave., Ste 1200 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Attorney AURA 10645 N. Tatum Blvd. Ste. 200-676 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Jason Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Greg Patterson Attorney Munger Chadwick 916 West Adams Suite 3 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 5 | | |
| Teena Jibilian Assistant Chief Administrative Law Judge Arizona Corporation Commission 10 11 12 Briana Kobor Program Director Vote Solar 360 22nd Street, Suite 730 Oakland, CA 94612 15 16 Curt Ledford McDonald Carano Wilson, LLP 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 Jay Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85007 Alan Kierman Director of Real Estate & Special Counsel IO Data Centers 615 N. 48th Street Phoenix, AZ 85008 Samuel L. Lofland Ryley Carlock & Applewhite One N. Central Ave., Set 1200 Phoenix, AZ 85004-4417 Craig Marks Attorney AURA 10645 N. Tatum Blvd. Ste. 200-676 Phoenix, AZ 85028 Jason Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Greg Patterson Attorney Munger Chadwick 916 West Adams Suite 3 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 6 | 16165 N. 83rd Ave, Suite 201 | |
| Assistant Chief Administrative Law Judge Arizona Corporation Commission 1200 W. Washington Phoenix, AZ 85007 Briana Kobor Program Director Vote Solar 360 22nd Street, Suite 730 Oakland, CA 94612 Curt Ledford McDonald Carano Wilson, LLP 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 Jay Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85004-2202 Director of Real Estate & Special Counsel IO Data Centers 615 N. 48th Street Phoenix, AZ 85008 Director of Real Estate & Special Counsel IO Data Centers 615 N. 48th Street Phoenix, AZ 85008 Counsel IO Data Centers 615 N. 48th Street Phoenix, AZ 85008 Samuel L. Lofland Ryley Carlock & Applewhite One N. Central Ave., Ste 1200 Phoenix, AZ 85004-4417 Craig Marks Attorney AURA 10645 N. Tatum Blvd. Ste. 200-676 Phoenix, AZ 85028 Jason Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Greg Patterson Attorney Munger Chadwick 916 West Adams Suite 3 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 7 | Peoria, AZ 85382 | |
| Judge Arizona Corporation Commission 1200 W. Washington Phoenix, AZ 85007 Briana Kobor Program Director Vote Solar 360 22nd Street, Suite 730 Oakland, CA 94612 Curt Ledford McDonald Carano Wilson, LLP 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 Jay Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85007 Counsel IO Data Centers 615 N. 48th Street Phoenix, AZ 85008 Samuel L. Lofland Ryley Carlock & Applewhite One N. Central Ave., Ste 1200 Phoenix, AZ 85004-4417 Craig Marks Attorney AURA 10645 N. Tatum Blvd. Ste. 200-676 Phoenix, AZ 85028 Jason Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Greg Patterson Attorney Munger Chadwick 916 West Adams Suite 3 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 8 | | Alan Kierman |
| 1200 W. Washington Phoenix, AZ 85007 Briana Kobor Program Director Vote Solar 360 22nd Street, Suite 730 Oakland, CA 94612 Curt Ledford McDonald Carano Wilson, LLP 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 Curt Ledford McDonald Carano Wilson, LLP 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 Jay Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85007 Samuel L. Lofland Ryley Carlock & Applewhite One N. Central Ave., Ste 1200 Phoenix, AZ 85004-4417 Craig Marks Attorney AURA 10645 N. Tatum Blvd. Ste. 200-676 Phoenix, AZ 85028 Jason Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Greg Patterson Attorney Munger Chadwick 916 West Adams Suite 3 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 9 | | |
| Briana Kobor Program Director Vote Solar 360 22nd Street, Suite 730 Oakland, CA 94612 Curt Ledford McDonald Carano Wilson, LLP 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 Jay Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85007 Samuel L. Lofland Ryley Carlock & Applewhite One N. Central Ave., Ste 1200 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Ryley Carlock & Applewhite One N. Central Ave., Ste 1200 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Craig Marks Attorney AURA 10645 N. Tatum Blvd. Ste. 200-676 Phoenix, AZ 85028 Jason Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Greg Patterson Attorney Munger Chadwick 916 West Adams Suite 3 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 10 | Arizona Corporation Commission 1200 W. Washington | |
| Program Director Vote Solar 360 22nd Street, Suite 730 Oakland, CA 94612 Curt Ledford McDonald Carano Wilson, LLP 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 Curt Ledford McDonald Carano Wilson, LLP 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 Jay Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney Michael Patten Attorney Michael Patten Attorney Noves Sellers & Willmer L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85007 Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 11 | Phoenix, AZ 85007 | Phoenix, AZ 85008 |
| Program Director Vote Solar 360 22nd Street, Suite 730 Oakland, CA 94612 Curt Ledford McDonald Carano Wilson, LLP 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 Curt Ledford McDonald Carano Wilson, LLP 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 Jay Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85007 Ryley Carlock & Applewhite One N. Central Ave., Ste 1200 Phoenix, AZ 85004-2417 Craig Marks Attorney AURA 10645 N. Tatum Blvd. Ste. 200-676 Phoenix, AZ 85028 Jason Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Greg Patterson Attorney Munger Chadwick 916 West Adams Suite 3 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 12 | Briana Kobor | Samuel L. Lofland |
| 14 360 22nd Street, Suite 730 Oakland, CA 94612 Phoenix, AZ 85004-4417 Curt Ledford McDonald Carano Wilson, LLP 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 Jay Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Phoenix, AZ 85007 Phoenix, AZ 85007 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 13 | Program Director | Ryley Carlock & Applewhite |
| Curt Ledford McDonald Carano Wilson, LLP 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 Jay Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Craig Marks Attorney AURA 10645 N. Tatum Blvd. Ste. 200-676 Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Greg Patterson Attorney Munger Chadwick 916 West Adams Suite 3 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 14 | 360 22nd Street, Suite 730 | |
| McDonald Carano Wilson, LLP 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 Jay Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Attorney AURA 10645 N. Tatum Blvd. Ste. 200-676 Phoenix, AZ 85028 Jason Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Greg Patterson Attorney Munger Chadwick 916 West Adams Suite 3 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 15 | | |
| 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 Las Vegas, NV 89102 Jay Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85004 AURA 10645 N. Tatum Blvd. Ste. 200-676 Phoenix, AZ 85028 Jason Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Greg Patterson Attorney Munger Chadwick 916 West Adams Suite 3 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 16 | | |
| Phoenix, AZ 85028 Phoenix, AZ 85028 Jay Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Phoenix, AZ 85007 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 17 | 2300 W. Sahara Ave., Suite 1200 | AURA |
| Jay Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Jason Moyes Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Greg Patterson Attorney Munger Chadwick 916 West Adams Suite 3 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 18 | Las vegas, NV 89102 | |
| Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Moyes Sellers & Hendricks Ltd. 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Greg Patterson Attorney Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85004-2202 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 19 | | |
| 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85004 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, AZ 85004 Greg Patterson Attorney Munger Chadwick 916 West Adams Suite 3 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 20 | | |
| 22 Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85004-2202 Michael Patten Attorney Munger Chadwick 916 West Adams Suite 3 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | | 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 | 1850 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 |
| Michael Patten Attorney SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85004-2202 Greg Patterson Attorney Munger Chadwick 916 West Adams Suite 3 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | | 11001111, 112 00001 | Thomas, The Good |
| 24 SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85004-2202 Attorney Munger Chadwick 916 West Adams Suite 3 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | | | |
| 25 One Arizona Center 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 Phoenix, AZ 85004-2202 Phoenix, AZ 85004-2202 | | SNELL & WILMER L.L.P. | Munger Chadwick |
| FIIOCIIIX, AZ 63004-2202 | | 400 E. Van Buren Street, Suite 1900 | |
| ZO | 26 | Prioenix, AZ 85004-2202 | |
| 27 | | | |

| 1 2 | Ebony Payton 139 Barnes Drive, Suite 1 Tyndall AFB, FL 32403 | Robert L. Pickels, Jr. Sedona City Attorney's Office 102 Roadrunner Drive Sedona, AZ 86336 |
|-----|---|--|
| . 3 | | |
| 4 | Daniel Pozefsky Chief Counsel | Steven Puck Director Government Affairs |
| 5 | RUCO | Sun City Homeowners Association |
| 6 | 1110 W. Washington, Suite 220 Phoenix, AZ 85007 | 10401 W. Coggins Drive Sun City, AZ 85351 |
| 7 | | |
| 8 | Pat Quinn AURA | Kaitlyn A. Redfield-Ortiz Lubin & Enoch, P.C. |
| 9 | 5521 E. Cholla St. Scottsdale, AZ 85254 | 349 N. 4th Avenue Phoenix, AZ 85003 |
| 10 | 1980 1980 | |
| 11 | Court Rich Attorney | Rob Robbins President |
| 12 | Rose Law Group, pc 7144 East Stetson Drive, Suite 300 | Property Owners & Resident Association |
| 13 | Scottsdale, AZ 85251 | 13815 Camino del Sol Sun City West, AZ 85372 |
| 14 | | |
| 15 | Lawrence Robertson, Jr. Attorney At Law | Timothy Sabo Snell & Wilmer |
| 16 | 210 West Continental Road Suite 216A | 400 East Van Buren Suite 1900 |
| 17 | Green Valley, AZ 85622 | Phoenix, AZ 85004 |
| 18 | Jeff Schlegel | Thomas E. Stewart |
| 19 | SWEEP 1167 W. Samalayuca Dr. | General Manager Granite Creek Power & Gas LLC |
| 20 | Tucson, AZ 85704 | 5316 East Voltaire Avenue Scottsdale, AZ 85254-3643 |
| 21 | | race a processor to the PAR assessor of Processor Selection (1997). The Paragraph of Paragraph o |
| 22 | Sheryl A. Sweeney Ryley Carlock & Applewhite | Gregory W. Tillman Senior Manager, Energy Regulatory |
| 23 | One N. Central Ave., Ste 1200 Phoenix, AZ 85004-4417 | Analysis Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. |
| 24 | 1100mx, 712 05007 7717 | 2011 S.E. 10" Street Bentonville, AR 72716 |
| 25 | | Demonvine, Inc. 12/10 |
| 26 | | |
| 27 | | |
| 28 | | |

| 1 2 3 4 | Emily A. Tornabene LUBIN & ENOCH, PC 349 North Fourth Avenue Phoenix, AZ 85003 | Andy Kvesic Director Legal Division Arizona Corporation Commission 1200 W. Washington Phoenix, AZ 85007 |
|------------------|---|--|
| 5 | Scott Wakefield | David I. Wallson |
| 6 | Attorney Hienton & Curry, P.L.L.C. | Paul J. Walker Executive Director ConservAmerica |
| 7 | 5045 N. 12th Street, Suite 110 Phoenix, AZ 85014-3302 | 971 South Centerville Road PMB 139 |
| 8 | 1 HOCHA, 712 03014 3302 | Sturgis, MI 49091 |
| 9 | Anthony Wanger | Charles Wesselhoft |
| 10 | President IO Data Centers | Deputy County Attorney Pima County 22 North Stone Ave. Suite 2100 |
| 11 | 615 N. 48th Street Phoenix, AZ 85008 | 32 North Stone Ave., Suite 2100 Tucson, AZ 85701 |
| 12 | Karen White | Ken Wilson |
| 13 | Attorney Air Force Utility Law Field Support | Western Resource Advocates 2260 Baseline Road, Suite 200 |
| 14 | Center AFLOA/JACL-ULFSC, 139 Barnes Dr. | Boulder, CO 80302 |
| 15 | Tyndall AFB, FL 32403 | |
| 16 | Warren Woodward | Gary Yaquinto |
| 17 | 200 Sierra Road Sedona, AZ 86336 | President & CEO Arizona Investment Council |
| 18 | | 2100 N. Central Avenue, Suite 210 Phoenix, AZ 85004 |
| 19 | | |
| 20 | Ellen Zuckerman Senior Associate | Cynthia Zwick 2700 N. 3rd Street, Suite 3040 |
| 21 | 4231 E. Catalina Drive Phoenix, AZ 85018 | Phoenix, AZ 85004 |
| 22 | | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | Schenk | |
| 25 | | |
| 26 | | |
| 27 | | |

ATTACHMENT 1

APS PROPOSED AMENDMENT NO. 1

TIME/DATE PREPARED:

COMPANY: Arizona Corporation Commission

AGENDA ITEM NO.

DOCKET NO(S). E-01345A-16-0036 & 16-0123

OPEN MEETING DATE:

This amendment would ensure that the terms from the settling parties' agreement are accurately and fully included in the decision. First, the amendment would include in the decision the express SCR deferral language as agreed to by the settling parties. Second, the amendment clarifies that the \$1.25M in anticipated crisis bill assistance is to be funded through the revenue requirement as stated in the settlement term sheet. Third, the amendment clarifies that the stay out period in the settlement goes to June 1, 2019, not June 19, 2019.

SCR Deferral Language

Page 22, Line 20 before "The Settlement Agreement"

INSERT "The Settlement Agreement authorizes APS to defer, for possible later recovery through rates, all non-fuel costs of owning, operating, and maintaining the Selective Catalytic Reduction environmental controls at the Four Corners Power Plant from the date such controls go into service until the inclusion of such costs into rates. And"

INSERT

"IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Arizona Public Service Company is authorized to defer for possible later recovery through rates, all non-fuel costs (as defined herein to include all O&M, property taxes, depreciation, and a return at APS's embedded cost of debt in this proceeding) of owning, operating, and maintaining the Selective Catalytic Reduction ("SCR") environmental controls at the Four Corners Power Plant. Nothing in this Decision shall be construed in any way to limit this Commission's authority to review the entirety of the project and to make any disallowances thereof due to imprudence, errors or inappropriate application of the requirements of this Decision."

Crisis Bill Assistance

Page 24, Line 10-11 after "\$1.25 million annually" **DELETE** "in shareholder provided funds"

Page 101, Line 28

INSERT

"IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that \$1.25 million of the revenue requirement increase approved in this order is dedicated to funding Arizona Public Service Company's crisis bill assistance program."

Stay Out Period

Page 22, Line 18 after "June" DELETE "19"

and REPLACE with "1"

Page 101, Line 27 after "rate case before June" DELETE "19"

and REPLACE with "1"

Page 101, line 12